LONG DISTANCE TRAINING SEMARANG RELIGIOUS TRAINING CENTER

Nikmatul Afiyah[1]*, Naili Farida [2], Hardi Warsono[3], Tri Yuniningsih[4]

[134]Department of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Politic Science, Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang
[2]Department of Business Administration, Faculty of Social and Politic Science, Universitas Diponegoro, Semarang
Central Java, IndonesiaE-mail: nikmatulafiyahssosms@students.undip.ac.id[1]*, faridanaili@ymail.com[2],
hardiwarsono@live.undip.ac.id[3], triyuniningsih26@gmail.com[4]

Abstract
Distance training has become a solution for the Semarang Religious Training Center in overcoming budget constraints and improving the competence of state civil servants. This study aims to analyze the implementation of distance learning based on George C. Edward's policy implementation model, which includes four factors: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The research method used is descriptive qualitative, with data analysis techniques based on interviews, observations, and document studies. The results of the study indicate that the implementation of distance learning at the Semarang Religious Training Center faces various challenges, such as limited human resource competence, lack of supporting facilities (such as soundproof rooms and internet access), and weak commitment of implementers in running the program. In addition, communication between organizers, participants, and teachers is not optimal, even though it has been supported by social media and online learning platforms. In terms of bureaucratic structure, the existing standard operating procedures still need to be improved to support the sustainability of the program more effectively. The conclusion of this study emphasizes the importance of enhancing human resource competence, providing adequate infrastructure, and better coordination between stakeholders to ensure the success of the implementation of distance learning.

Keywords: *Distance Learning, Civil Servant Competency, Policy Implementation, Religious Training Center.*

INTRODUCTION

The provision of good public services for the community certainly requires reliable and quality Human Resources, thus demanding competent state civil servants. Competent state civil servants can be achieved through competency development as one way to improve the performance of civil servants. Article 203, paragraph 3 of Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 states that every civil servant has the same rights and opportunities to be included in competency development by considering the results of the performance assessment and competency assessment of the civil servant concerned. The competency development is carried out for at least 20 hours of lessons in 1 year (UU ASN, 2014).

Competency development is carried out by the government through educational and training institutions. Educational and training institutions have the task of managing the implementation of training and becoming a center for developing state apparatus resources and improving the competency of state apparatus Human Resources. Human Resources of the State Apparatus who have participated in training are expected to be able to provide excellent service in all aspects of management and by actual needs.

Training itself is part of education, which is a means of coaching and career development and one of the efforts to improve the quality of human resources according to job needs. Experts have many opinions about the meaning and definition of training, but from the various opinions, in principle, they are not much different. Training is a series of individual activities in improving expertise and knowledge systematically so that they can have professional performance in their fields. Training is a learning process that allows employees to carry out current work according to standards. (Widodo, 2015). In the book "Human Resource Management," the definition of training is a process to improve the skills, knowledge, and competencies of workers to improve their performance in their current jobs (Dessler, 2020).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Education and training are the processes of organizing teaching and learning to improve the capabilities of Civil Servants. Training is important to implement because it is an effort to improve the quality of human resources according to job needs. Education is a process to improve the theoretical, conceptual, and moral abilities of employees. Good education can lead participants towards changes in attitudes and behavior in carrying out their

duties and responsibilities. (Hasibuan, 2010). Training is any effort to improve employee performance in a particular job that is currently their responsibility or a job that is related to the job. This shows that training is something important to be given to workers (employees) in an organization to create better performance. (Gomes, 2003). The purpose of training in general is to develop employees (Fathoni, 2006) so that they can:

a.   Improve their personality and spirit of devotion to the organization and the community,
b.   Improve quality and ability, as well as skills both in carrying out their duties and leadership;
c.   Train and improve work mechanisms and sensitivity in carrying out tasks,
d.   Train and improve work in planning, and
e.   Improve knowledge and work skills.

Based on Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 article 210 paragraph 2, competency development can be carried out in the form of

a.   Education; and/or,
b.   Training.

Competency development through training can be done through classical and non-classical training channels. Competency development in the form of classical training is carried out through a face-to-face learning process in the classroom, at least through training, seminars, courses, and briefings. Competency development in the form of non-classical training is carried out at least through e-learning, on-the-job guidance, distance training, internships, and exchanges between civil servants and private employees. (Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management). Regulation of the Minister of Religion Number 19 of 2020 Article 2 also explains that the implementation of Human Resources training aims to develop human resources competencies, including knowledge, skills, and attitudes/behaviors. Regulations governing distance learning or education in Indonesia have been accommodated in several regulations. This indicates that distance learning is indeed a necessity for demands in education.

Regulation of the Minister of Education and Culture Number 109 of 2013, Article 1, paragraph 1 states that distance education is a teaching and learning process carried out remotely through the use of various communication media (Ministry of Education and Culture, 2013). Previously, Law Number 12 of 2012 concerning Higher Education in the seventh section concerning Distance Education stated the same thing. It is stated in the Law that distance education is intended to a) provide Higher Education services to groups of people who cannot attend face-to-face or regular education, b) to expand access and facilitate higher education services in education and learning. (Law, 2012).

Meanwhile, in the Regulation of the State Administration Agency Number 8 of 2018, it is stated that e-learning is the development of Civil Servant competencies, which is carried out in the form of training by optimizing the use of information and communication technology to achieve learning goals and improve performance. The implementation of e-learning training is aimed at a) increasing the efficiency and effectiveness of the implementation of competency development, b) expanding access for Civil Servants in developing competencies on an ongoing basis, and c) accelerating improvements in organizational performance (State Administration Institute, 2018).

Furthermore, in the Regulation of the Minister of Religion No. 19 of 2020 concerning the Implementation of Human Resource Training at the Ministry of Religion, paragraph 7, article 24 paragraph 1, it is stated that training is carried out in classical and non-classical forms, and in paragraph 3 it is stated that non-classical training is carried out in the form of distance training. Distance Training has become an option for the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center in diversifying training considering the limited availability of the budget which has an impact on the limited face-to-face training program which results in a limited number of alumni, while the demands for training needs in competency development must still be implemented considering the still low opportunity for State Civil Apparatus to be able to participate in training. Distance Learning is a training option because with a smaller budget than face-to-face training, Distance Learning can produce the same number of alumni as face-to-face training. However, there are still many obstacles in the implementation of Distance Learning, including the incompetence of human resources, lack of infrastructure, weak commitment of implementers, and others.

To answer the existing problems, the researcher used the policy implementation model from George C. Edward, although it was explained previously quoted from Riant Nugroho's book that there is no single best model as a guide for policy implementation. George C. Edward's implementation model suggests paying attention to four main issues so that policy implementation can run effectively. Based on this, the author uses the four issues as analysis materials that are considered relevant to the problems to be discussed. Some of these indicators include:

a.   Communication (1. Transmission, 2. Clarity of program goals and objectives, and 3. Consistency)
b.   Resources (1. Adequate staff, 2. Expertise to carry out tasks, 3. Authority, and 4. Facilities)
c.   Disposition/attitude (1. Implementor response to policy, and 2. Implementer awareness)
d.   Bureaucracy (1. Existence of standard operating procedures, 2. No strong authority in policy implementation, and 3. Narrow views that can hinder change).

METHOD

The method used in this study is a descriptive analytical method with a qualitative approach, which is trying to describe and analyze the implementation of distance training in the work area of the Semarang Religious Training Center. The selection of this method is intended to obtain descriptive data in the form of written or spoken words from people and observable behavior. Qualitative research aims to obtain information from the situation and see the relationship with the variables studied. The qualitative descriptive method is a research method used to research the natural conditions of objects where the researcher is the key instrument, while the sampling of data sources is carried out purposively (Sugiyono, 2014; Creswell, 2016, Taylor et al, 2016; Yin, 2018).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
Implementation of Distance Training at the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center

The Religious Education and Training Center, commonly called the Religious Training Center, is a technical implementation unit of the Ministry of Religion's training based in the regions and has the task of implementing administrative training, technical education training and religious technical training for human resources in their respective work areas based on the policies of the Head of the Research and Development Agency, and Education and Training of the Ministry of Religion. The Semarang Religious Training Center is a technical implementation unit tasked with implementing training for HR in the work areas of Central Java Province and the Special Region of Yogyakarta.

Regulation of the Minister of Religion Number 19 of 2020 concerning the Implementation of Human Resource Training at the Ministry of Religion is the basis for the Semarang Religious Training Center to implement distance learning. It is stated in the regulation of the Minister of Religion that the training is carried out in classical and non-classical forms. Classical training is carried out in the form of activities that emphasize the face-to-face learning process in the classroom, while distance training is a form of non-classical training in addition to other forms such as coaching, mentoring, e-learning, open nature learning and others.

Distance training is a form of non-classical training carried out at the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center. As with the implementation of classical Human Resources training, this distance training is also intended for Human Resources including: Civil Servants, Government Employees with Work Agreements, District Courts-State Civil Apparatus Employees, and the Community. To achieve the objectives of implementing distance training in improving the competence of Human Resources and so as not to deviate far from the standards to be achieved, the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center is guided by the Regulation of the Minister of Religion and the Technical Instructions for Distance Training. The implementation of distance training at the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center is an implementation of policy. Policy implementation is, in principle, a way for a policy to achieve its objectives (Lester & Stewart, 2000; Tachjan, 2006; Agustino, 2008; Hill & Hupe, 2010; Nugroho, 2017).

No more and no less. The implementation of Distance Training is the implementation of Distance Training by the training program that has been determined based on the Regulation of the Minister of Religion No. 19 of 2020 concerning the Implementation of Human Resources Training at the Ministry of Religion. This regulation from the Minister of Religion was then strengthened by the emergence of technical instructions for distance training issued by the Center for Administrative Personnel Education and Training of the Ministry of Religion's Research and Development and Training Agency.

Policy implementation is the stage of implementing a policy after it has been determined as a regulation. The implementation of the distance training policy at the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center is an implementation of the policy in organizing Human Resource Training at the Ministry of Religion. The technical implementation of the distance training is guided by the technical instructions for distance training issued by the Administrative Personnel Education and Training Center.

A. Communication

Communication is one of the factors that determines the success of achieving the objectives of implementing public policy. Realizing effective implementation is not easy because it requires commitment from the implementers to know what they should do. Communication is the process of conveying information from the communicator to the communicant. In this case, it is policy communication which is the process of conveying policy information from policy makers to policy implementers.

In this study, three things are seen from the communication factor, namely the implementer's understanding/knowledge in implementing the policy; clarity, goals and objectives of the program; consistency (the implementer's orders must be consistent and clear). Previous research conducted by Astri Siti Fatimah (2020) stated that in communication, there is a two-way interaction pattern between teachers, education personnel, students, and parents in a planned, systematic, and measurable manner with the use of non-information technology. Therefore, it is necessary to review the implementation of distance education in terms of methods, strategies, and learning

techniques by choosing the right communication media. Two-way communication has been carried out at the Semarang Religious Training Center as evidenced by the existence of a communication media in the form of a WhatsApp group between the committee, teachers, and students, which can be a forum for technical discussion of implementation and materials. Three things in the communication factor in this study can be described in the following explanation:

1. **Transmission**
   The transmission in the implementation of the policy in question is the understanding/knowledge of the management of the Semarang Religious Training Center as a UPT that organizes distance training in transmitting goals and targets to target groups. The incident that occurred in the transmission of the goals and objectives was a misunderstanding, this was because communication had gone through several levels of bureaucracy so that what was expected was deviated in the middle of the road. BDK Semarang carried out transmission through the socialization of distance education to work units. Socialization of distance education at the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center was carried out in various ways, namely in addition to sending official letters to work units, socialization was also carried out through the official website of the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center https://bdksemarang.kemenag.go.id/home, via Instagram, Facebook, Twitter, TikTok, and WhatsApp groups.

   Good communication will also result in good implementation. Transmission in the implementation of distance education policies at the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center will be realized if supported by socialization and education to work units through the work unit admin about the goals and objectives of the program. Although the socialization has been carried out well, the right target program in this case the selection of prospective participants is not right. Participants who get assignments because they are appointed and not of their own accord will tend not to be serious about participating in the training, so that it will have an impact on the output/results of the training.

2. **Clarity**
   The clarity in question is that the objectives and targets of the distance training policy must be truly clear and not confusing so that they can be understood by the target group. The ambiguity of the policy message does not always hinder implementation, at a certain level, but implementers need clear information in implementing the policy so that the objectives to be achieved can be achieved according to the policy content. The clarity of information on distance training at the Semarang Religious Education and Training Center is stated in the Regulation of the Minister of Religion No. 19 of 2020 and the Technical Guidelines for managing distance training. The objectives and targets of distance learning are further contained in the Terms of Reference and Guidebook. The training guidebook can be accessed by participants on the Semarang Learning Center Training and Training Center Learning Management System.

   The objectives and targets of the policy that are prepared must, of course, also be by the needs of the target group. The purpose of organizing training in the Regulation of the Minister of Religion Number 19 of 2020 Article 2 is to develop civil servant competencies, including knowledge, skills, and attitudes/behaviors. Furthermore, the training targets are stated in Article 3, namely:
   1. Civil Servants
   2. Government Employees with Employment Agreements
   3. District Court-State Civil Apparatus Employees
   4. Community
   The success in achieving the objectives of the implementation policy cannot be separated from the support, awareness and also understanding/knowledge of the implementers, namely the committee, managers, teachers and participants in the implementation of distance training. The role of the implementer is by their involvement starting from the planning, implementation, evaluation, and administrative and technological support stages.

3. Consistency
   The consistency in question is that the orders/information given in the implementation of a communication must be consistent and clear (to be implemented and executed). This is because if the orders given often change, it can confuse implementers in the field. Orders/information in policy implementation have two forms, namely: (1) information related to how to implement the policy, meaning that implementers must know what they must do when they receive orders to take action, (2) information regarding compliance data from implementers to the rules and regulations that have been set, namely that implementers must know whether other people involved in implementing the policy comply with the rules.

B. Resources

Resources are an important factor that plays a role in determining the success of policy implementation. Edward III (1980) said that "However clear and consistent the provisions or rules are, and however accurate the delivery of the provisions or rules, if the policy implementers responsible for implementing the policy do not have the resources to do their job effectively, then the implementation of the policy will not be effective". In addition, Hafis et al (2013) stated that one of the things that makes policy implementation successful is adequate resources. This study uses four important aspects of resources, namely adequate staff, expertise to carry out tasks, authority, and facilities needed to implement the policy.

1. Adequate staff

The success of a program cannot be separated from the support of human resources, so adequate human resources and competence in implementing distance education are needed. Human resources in distance training at the Semarang Religious Training Center consist of managers/organizers, teachers, and participants.

1. Manager/Organizer. The manager/organizer of the training is a civil servant who is assigned to a training institution and who functionally plans, implements, supervises, controls, and evaluates training by referring to the guidelines set by the supervising agency.
2. Teachers. Teachers are instructors, experts, practitioners, or other resource persons who have expertise/specialization according to the training needed.
3. Participants. Training participants are civil servants, Government Employees with Work Agreements, Non-Civil Servant Employees, and the community who carry out the duties and functions of the Ministry of Religion.

The results of the research found that there were adequate teaching resources available; this was evidenced by the existence of specializations, Training of Trainers certificates, and teaching experience. However, the researcher also found, based on the results of the interview, that only some of the teachers had the competencies needed. Likewise, the organizers did not all have the expected abilities, several committees had limitations both physically and in terms of competence in completing their tasks as committees. Findings from the participant resource side show that participants who have knowledge of the training material and are supported by a good understanding of information technology tend to find it easier to follow the learning process, both technically in managing Building Learning Commitment and in terms of material content. It is often faced that in terms of age, many participants are the older generation so that they tend to be slower in following learning through the Building Learning Commitment application. The success of implementing distance education at the Semarang religious training center is determined by how human resources can support and implement the program according to their respective roles.

The above is in line with the opinion of George C. Edwards III that the main resource in policy implementation is staff or human resources. Failures that often occur in policy implementation are partly due to insufficient, inadequate, or incompetent staff in their fields. Adding the number of staff or implementors alone is not enough, it is also necessary to have sufficient staff with the necessary expertise and abilities (competent and capable) in implementing the policy or carrying out the tasks desired by the policy itself (Edwards, 1980). Human resources in the Semarang religious training center are quantitatively sufficient to organize training programs, but in terms of quantity, there is still a need to improve the competence and ability of human resources. Competence and ability to implement distance education at the Semarang Religious Training Center are greatly needed to achieve the goal of organizing quality training.

2. Expertise to carry out tasks

According to Edward III (1980) if the implementation of a policy is to be effective, then the policy implementers must not only know what will be done but must also have the ability to implement it, so that in practice there is no bias. The results of research conducted by researchers show that not all human resources (managers/organizers, teachers, and participants) have the expertise to complete their tasks. Even though human resources are sufficient in implementing the program, if they do not have the skills needed to carry out their duties and functions, the implementation of distance education policies will not be effective. Human resources must have accuracy and appropriateness between the number of staff needed and the expertise they have according to the work tasks they handle (Considene, 1996; Dunn, 1999; Dye, 1978; Widodo, 2009).

3. Authority

Authority is one of the resources in policy implementation. Authority is needed to guarantee and ensure that the policies to be implemented are what is desired. Edward III (1980) explained that sufficient authority to make its own decisions owned by an institution will influence the institution in implementing a policy. The results of the research stated that the organizers and instructors have the authority to implement the training that ensures that the

training can be directed as expected. The organizers and instructors remind and provide opportunities for participants to complete assignments before determining graduation. This is done because sometimes participants feel that they have submitted assignments, but after being checked, it turns out that they have not submitted them, which results in the instructor not being able to provide an assessment on the Learning Management System Building Learning Commitment. Failure to fulfill the assessment on the assignment certainly affects the overall value recap so that it can fail.

The Semarang Religious Training Center, as the training organizer, has the authority to determine whether or not participants pass based on the results of the assessment of three aspects, namely knowledge, skills, and attitudes. BDK Semarang is an organizing institution that is directly involved in the training implementation process, so it should have sufficient authority to make its own decisions within the limits of implementing policies that are within its authority.

4. Facilities

Facilities are an important factor in policy implementation. The implementor may have sufficient staff, understand what they have to do, and have the authority to carry out their duties, but without supporting facilities (facilities and infrastructure), the implementation of the policy will not be successful. The results of the research conducted by the researcher show that supporting facilities in the implementation of distance training, such as soundproof rooms, wifi, the number of Zoom accounts, and applications for online face-to-face meetings have not been met optimally. This can be seen when the training runs simultaneously in one period (12 batches). To avoid chaos during learning due to simultaneous online face-to-face meetings, it is necessary to organize the division of learning spaces as well as for easy access to wifi in each room in different buildings. Better and more adequate facilities will certainly support the success of the training implementation. The above is in line with the theory of Edward III (1980), which states that limited facilities and equipment in implementing policies can fail to implement policies. Limited facilities also result in a lack of motivation from actors in implementing policies.

C. Disposition

Disposition is the willingness, desire, and tendency of policy makers to implement policies seriously so that the objectives of the policy can be realized. The disposition factor in this study includes the implementer's response to the distance learning training policy and the implementer's awareness. The results of the study conducted by the researcher showed that some organizers and teachers responded to accept and some rejected. Implementers who rejected it tended not to have the will and desire to get out of their comfort zone with the training that had been carried out. This is because when carrying out training with a new model, it will bring consequences for learning something new, new learning designs and techniques, which the will to do is still lacking. Research on "Implementation of Distance Learning Policies During the Covid-19 Pandemic" conducted by Harlis, et al. with an analysis using the implementation model theory of George Edwards III (1980) showed similar results that the implementation had not run optimally because the variables of communication, resources, disposition and bureaucratic structure had not been met. The unfulfilled disposition, namely the lack of teacher commitment, can be seen from the many teachers who leave their obligations to accompany students in carrying out learning at home, especially teachers who are allowed to be creative in providing their learning.

According to Edward III (1980), if the implementation of the policy is to be successful, effective and efficient, then the implementers of the policy must not only know what will be done and have the ability to carry out the policy, but they must also have the will to implement the policy. The implementation of distance learning in Semarang religious training center will be successful if the implementer, in addition to knowing what is being done, can do it and must also have the will to implement the policy. Lack of will can cause the policy implementation to fail.

D. Bureaucratic Structure

The bureaucratic structure includes aspects such as organizational structure, division of authority, relationships between organizational units in the organization concerned, and the relationship between the organization and external organizations, and so on. The results of the study conducted by the researcher showed that the bureaucratic structure in the implementation of distance training at the Semarang religious training center already has standard operating procedures for the Implementation of Distance Training, which are the service standards in the implementation of distance training. The standard operating procedures that have been prepared regarding the Implementation of distance training are not sufficient as a service standard to achieve maximum results because they are not supported by other standard operating procedures that are still related to distance training, namely in preparation, implementation, and evaluation. These standard operating procedures include standard operating procedures for implementing the selection of distance training participants, Standard operating procedures for Class

Management Building Learning Commitment, standard operating procedures for Processing Participant Scores, Standard operating procedures for Determining Participant Graduation, Standard operating procedures for Making Certificates, and others. The unavailability of other standard operating procedures related to the implementation of distance training will likely affect the results of the implementation of distance training because there are weaknesses in the bureaucratic structure.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings and discussions conducted, the researcher drew several conclusions on the problems discussed, namely in the communication aspect of implementing distance training supported by the Information and Documentation Management Officer Team so that transmission with socialization through various social media is more optimal. In the resource indicator, there is still a lack of competence and ability of implementers, which can have an impact on failure/less than optimal learning objectives. Facilities and infrastructure that are not yet optimal (such as soundproof rooms, wifi, number of Zoom accounts). From the disposition aspect, there is still a tendency for rejection and lack of awareness from implementers in implementing distance training. Not only having knowledge and skills but also the willingness to implement policies and indicators of bureaucratic structure, there is no standard operating procedure for technical procedures that support the standard operating procedure for implementing distance training. Lack of coordination and cooperation between implementers.

Based on the analysis of the results and conclusions, the researcher recommends distance training that includes communication requires transmission through socialization with cooperation between the committee/organizer and the Information and Documentation Management Officer Team, supporting resources, employee coaching to foster support and awareness in implementation, and the availability of standard operating procedure documents. What needs to be attempted is communication with transmission through socialization with cooperation between the committee/organizer and the Information and Documentation Management Officer team, supporting resources, employee development to foster support and awareness in implementation, and availability of standard operating procedure documents.

REFERENCES

Agustino, Leo. (2008) *Dasar-Dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung, Alfabeta.

Al Hafis, R. I., Hakim, A., & Haryono, B. S. (2013). Aktor Pelaksana Pengelolaan Transportasi Publik Perkotaan (Studi Kasus Bus Trans Metro di Kota Pekanbaru). *WACANA, Jurnal Sosial dan Humaniora*, *16*(4), 171-178.

Creswell, J. W. (2016). Pendekatan Metode Penelitian Kualitatif, Kuantitatif dan Campuran (Edisi Keempat). *Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar*.

Considene, Mark. (1996) *Public Policy: A Critical Approach*. Australia, Macmillan Education, Pty, Ltd.

Dessler, Gary (2020), Human Resource Management, Edisi 16, Harlow: Pearson Education. Limited

Dunn, William N. (1999) *Pengantar Analisis Kebijakan Publik*. Edisi Kedua. Yogyakarta, UGM Press.

Dye, Thomas R. (1978) *Understanding public Policy*. Prentice Hall, Inc., Englewood Cliffs, N.J.

Edwards III, G. C. (1980). *Public Policy Implementing*. Washington. D.C.: Congressional Quarterly Press.

Fathoni, A. (2006). *Manajemen Sumer Daya Manusia*. Rineka Cipta.

Gomes, F. C. (2003). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Penerbit Andi Offset.

Hasibuan, M. S. (2010). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. PT. Bumi Aksara.

Hill. Michael & Hupe. Pater. (2010) *Implementing Public Policy*. Second Edition. London, SAGE Publication Ltd.

Lester, James P & Stewart, Joseph JR. (2000) *Public Policy: An Evolutionary Approach*. USA, Wadsworth/Thomson Learning.

Nugroho, R. (2017). *Public Policy: Diamika Kebijakan—Analisis Kebijakan—Manajemen Kebijakan.* PT. Elex Media Komputindo-Kelompok Gramedia.

Peraturan Pemerintah No. 11 Tahun 2017 tentang Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil

Peraturan Menteri Agama (PMA) No. 19 tahun 2020 tentang Penyelenggaraan Pelatihan Sumber Daya Manusia pada Kementerian Agama

Sugiyono. (2014). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*. Alfabeta.

Tachjan. (2006) *Implementasi Kebijakan Publik.* Bandung, Asosiasi Ilmu Politik Indonesia (AIPI).

Taylor, S. J., Bogdan, R., & DeVault, M. L. (2016) *Introduction to Qualitative Research Methods: A Guidebook and Resource* (4th ed). John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Undang-Undang No. 5 Tahun 2014 tentang Aparatur Sipil Negara.

Widodo, S. (2015). *Manajemen Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia.* Yogyakarta: Pusaka Pelajar.

Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case Study Research and Application: Design and Methods*. (6th ed.). Sage.