Multidisciplinary Output Research For Actual and International Issue (MORFAI Journal) ISSN (e): 2808-6635
Volumes 5 No. 5 (2025)

EVALUATING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF SUBJECT AREA SCIENCE CLUB PROGRAM USING CIPP MODEL

Jupri Marsal[1], Yusuf Avicena[2], Siti Fermaisuri[3]
Magister Pendidikan Ekonomi / Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang
Magister Pendidikan Ekonomi / Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang
Magister Pendidikan Ekonomi / Universitas Negeri Padang, Padang
Corresponding E-mail: juprimarsal.feunp@gmail.com [1], yusufavicena5@gmail.com [2], sitifermaisuri2000@gmail.com [3]

Received	: 21 April 2025	Published	: 30 June 2025
Revised	: 30 April 2025	DOI	: https://doi.org/10.54443/morfai.v5i5.3204
Accepted	: 18 May 2025	Link Publish	: https://radjapublika.com/index.php/MORFAI/article/view/3204

Abstract

This study evaluates the implementation of the Science Club program in the field of study at MAN Insan Cendekia, Batam City using the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model. This club aims to develop students' interests, talents, and competencies in science and support the strengthening of the profile of superior science students. Data were obtained through a mixed method: questionnaire (Likert scale), interviews, observations, and documentation. The results indicated that the program was quite effective with all aspects rated as "Excellent." However, several challenges in terms of facilities, motivation for high-achieving students, and relevance of science applications were found. Recommendations for improvement include increasing resources, diversifying activities, and an impact-based evaluation system.

Keywords: ***CIPP Model, Development of Science Interests, MAN Insan Cendekia, Program Evaluation, Science Club***

INTRODUCTION

Science clubs serve as strategic platforms for nurturing students' interests, talents, and competencies in science. Beyond complementing formal classroom instruction, they provide essential opportunities for cultivating 21st-century soft skills such as creativity, collaboration, critical thinking, and problem-solving. At MAN Insan Cendekia Kota Batam, the science club was established as part of a structured initiative to foster a culture of research and to prepare students for participation in national and international science competitions. This initiative aligns with the school's broader vision of producing high-achieving, devout individuals who possess strong scientific and technological capabilities that can be applied in real-world contexts. However, questions remain regarding the overall effectiveness of the science club's implementation, particularly in relation to goal attainment, resource utilization, and the sustainability of its outcomes. Although science clubs are theoretically designed to support both curricular goals and student potential development, in practice, their impact is seldom assessed through systematic evaluation. It is therefore critical to examine the alignment between student needs, program design, and actual outcomes.

Furthermore, international assessments such as the 2018 Program for International Student Assessment (PISA) indicate that Indonesian students continue to underperform in science literacy, with an average score of 396—significantly below the OECD average of 489. This underscores the urgent need for initiatives like science clubs to bridge gaps in science education and competency development. Several studies underscore the value of science clubs in elite educational institutions. For instance, Wahyuni (2020) found that participation in science clubs enhances students' interest in science and encourages active involvement in experimental activities. Similarly, research by Setiawan & Aisyah (2021) revealed that in research-oriented schools—such as model schools and boarding madrasas—science clubs play an important role in shaping students' scientific character. Nevertheless, these clubs often face challenges such as a shortage of expert mentors and limited time allocation. Despite these findings, few studies have specifically evaluated the effectiveness of science club programs using a comprehensive evaluation framework in high-performing institutions, such as MAN Insan Cendekia. This school uniquely integrates

academic excellence, spiritual values, and research development—highlighting the need for a more holistic understanding of how science clubs function in such environments.

Therefore, this study aims to thoroughly evaluate the implementation of the science club program at MAN Insan Cendekia Batam City using the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model. This model was selected due to the capability to assess the effectiveness of the program from four main dimensions: (1) Context, which is the extent to which the science club program is aligned with students' needs and the school's vision; (2) Input, which includes the readiness of resources such as mentor teachers, laboratory facilities, and budget support; (3) Process, which examines the process of implementing club activities, including learning methods and student involvement; and (4) Product, which are tangible results such as increased motivation, participation in competitions, and students' academic achievements in science. Through this approach, the researcher is expected to fill the fap in evaluative studies of science clubs in excellent schools and recommend the improvement based on data that can be used by school managers, club coaches, and ministries in developing programs that are more effective, relevant, and impactful to enhance the quality of science education in Indonesia.

Objectives

1) To evaluate the context of science club implementation in terms of its suitability with the vision of MAN Insan Cendekia Kota Batam, the development of students' science interest, and the need for science exploration.
2) To analyze the inputs (resources) supporting the science club in the form of facilities, coaching, and scheduling.
3) To evaluate the process of implementing science club activities in the form of learning methods, participation, and feedback.
4) To measure the products (outcome) of science clubs on science understanding, science achievement, participation, and feedback.

LITERATURE REVIEW

1) CIPP Evaluation Model (Stufflebeam, 1971)

The CIPP model, developed by Daniel L. Stufflebeam, is one of the most comprehensive and widely adopted frameworks for program evaluation in the field of education. The acronym CIPP stands for Context, Input, Process, and Product—each representing a critical dimension for generating strategic information to support decision-making and continuous program improvement. Context Evaluation: This component focuses on identifying the needs, challenges, and environmental factors that justify the implementation of a program. In the context of science clubs, context evaluation examines the alignment of the program with the institution's vision and mission, the specific needs of students in science education, and the broader state of science learning within the school. This ensures the relevance and necessity of the program from the outset. Input Evaluation: This stage assesses the adequacy and availability of resources essential for the program's success. It includes evaluating human resources (e.g., mentor teachers and trainers), material resources (e.g., learning modules, laboratory equipment), physical infrastructure (e.g., dedicated spaces and facilities), and financial support. The input evaluation is crucial for determining whether the foundational elements required for implementation are in place and sufficient.

Process Evaluation: This dimension focuses on the actual implementation of the program. It reviews how activities are conducted, the instructional methods employed, the level of student engagement, and the overall effectiveness of program management. Process evaluation helps identify operational strengths and weaknesses, including any technical or managerial issues that need timely intervention to ensure program effectiveness. Product Evaluation: The final component measures the outcomes and impacts of the program, both in the short and long term. In the case of science clubs, product evaluation may involve assessing improvements in students' scientific knowledge and skills, their performance in competitions, and increased motivation and interest in science. Evaluating program outcomes provides critical evidence of success and justifies the allocation of resources. Overall, the CIPP model is particularly well-suited for evaluating extracurricular initiatives such as science clubs. By offering a holistic view from planning through implementation to results, it serves as a robust framework for generating recommendations to enhance program effectiveness and sustainability.

2) Science Club in Education

Science clubs as extracurricular activities have an important function in strengthening learning in the STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics) field. According to Sofiani et al. (2018), science clubs serve as an alternative space for students to deepen their understanding of science in a contextual and applicable manner

outside the formal curriculum. Through this club, students not only develop cognitive aspects, but also 21st century skills such as critical thinking, collaboration, and scientific communication.

The success of the science club program is largely determined by several factors, including:

Teacher Support: Mentor teachers who have high competence in their field and are able to guide with appropriate approaches greatly influence the success of the program.

Adequate Facilities: The facilities such as laboratories, experimental materials, and access to information are important in carrying out scientific projects or research. Active Learning Methods: The implementation of project-based learning, experimentation, and contextual learning methods can increase student's enthusiasm in learning science (NRC, 2015).

Science clubs are also a place to channel students' interests and talents through competitions such as the National Science Olympiad (OSN), youth scientific research, and various innovation and technology competitions. Active participation in these activities can increase students' confidence and motivation to pursue science further.

3) MAN Insan Cendekia as a School of Excellence

MAN Insan Cendekia is a boarding high school under the auspices of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia and is known as an excellent school with an emphasis on the integration of science and Islamic values. The school is designed to produce a generation of Muslims who are intellectually superior, strong in character, and able to compete globally, especially in the fields of science and technology.

Within the framework of talent development, MAN Insan Cendekia has several missions to:

a) Prepare future leaders who master science and technology, have high fighting power, are creative, innovative, proactive, and have a strong foundation of faith and piety.
b) Develop the interests, talents, and potential of students to achieve achievements at national and international levels.
c) Improve the knowledge and professional abilities of educators and education personnel in accordance with the development of the world of education.
d) Make MAN Insan Cendekia Batam City as an educational institution that has good and independent governance.
e) Make MAN Insan Cendekia Kota Batam as a model in the development of learning Science Technology and Faith and Piety for other educational institutions.

Science club in MAN Insan Cendekia Kota Batam becomes one of the strategic media in realizing the mission. The club not only functions as a training facility for science competitions, but also as a space for scientific and spiritual exploration, where students can interpret science as part of worship and the search for meaning in life.

With the integration spirit of Islam and Science, the club is expected to:

a) Pursue the birth of ethical Muslim scientists.
b) Produce scientific work that is not only innovate but also beneficial to society.
c) Foster student interest in careers related to science and technology as a real contribution to the development of the nation and the ummah.

METHOD

This study employs a mixed-methods approach, integrating both quantitative (questionnaire) and qualitative (interview and observation) methods. The research population comprises all student members of the science club from the 2022–2024 period, totaling 46 students, as well as the club's supervising teachers. The sampling technique used total sampling for the student participants, while purposive sampling was applied to select two supervising teachers for the qualitative component. Data collection techniques included a Likert-scale questionnaire to assess students' perceptions across the four dimensions of the CIPP model: context, input, process, and product. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with the supervising teachers to explore perceived challenges and successes in the implementation of the science club. Observations were carried out through documentation of club activities—specifically focusing on activity frequency, student participation, and instructional methods used. Additionally, archival documentation of student achievements (such as competition awards and scientific outputs) was analyzed. Quantitative data were analyzed using descriptive statistics (percentages and means) with the assistance of SPSS software. Questionnaire results were evaluated for each CIPP dimension and categorized as follows: Excellent (80–100%), Good (60–79%), Fair (40–59%), and Poor (<40%). Qualitative data analysis employed data triangulation, thematic reduction, and interpretive analysis. The research instrument has been tested for content validity (expert judgment) and reliability (Cronbach's Alpha), yielding a score of 0.952 (indicating high reliability).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. Context Aspect

Evaluation of the context aspect from students showed Excellent result (90.05%) that the Science Club program in general was in accordance with the vision and goals of MAN Insan Cendekia as a science-based school. Most students (85%) stated that the club activities are in line with the direction of science education development. This indicates an alignment between the institution's vision and the club's activities. However, there are still about 15% of students who do not fully understand the vision, indicating the need for more intensive socialization, both directly and through school information media. The development of students' scientific potential was acknowledged by a significant majority of respondents (80%). The science club is perceived as a valuable platform for enhancing scientific skills through hands-on experiments, group discussions, and project-based learning. Nevertheless, some students, such as Hamid Amirudin, felt underrepresented or disengaged, likely due to limited participation or unclear roles within the club. Regarding the clarity of the club's objectives, 75% of students responded positively. However, 25% indicated that the goals were not clearly communicated. This points to a need for improved internal communication, especially in articulating the club's vision, mission, and specific objectives to ensure that all members share a unified direction.

In terms of curriculum support, most students agreed that the science club activities enriched and complemented their formal science education. While the majority found the materials relevant, a portion of students felt a weak connection between club content and classroom learning. This underscores the importance of coordination between subject teachers and science club mentors to align club themes with curricular goals. Students also felt encouraged to explore their creativity, with many reporting that the club provided adequate space to nurture curiosity through various scientific projects. However, some students noted that the structure of activities was overly rigid. To address this, it is recommended that the club incorporate more diverse and open-ended explorations—such as independent research, interdisciplinary collaborations, or student-led investigations. From the perspective of the science club advisors, interview data indicated that the program is strategically aligned with the school's vision as a science-focused institution. Activities emphasizing the National Science Olympiad (OSN) and real-world scientific applications (e.g., applied economics and renewable energy projects) demonstrate a dual focus: theoretical-competitive and practical-innovative development. However, differences in focus between the two interviewed coaches suggest a lack of unified direction. While this variation can be interpreted as programmatic flexibility across scientific domains, more structured integration across disciplines would enhance overall cohesion. The main challenges identified by the supervising teachers relate to a combination of internal and external factors. Students often begin with enthusiasm but struggle to maintain consistency, particularly when completing scientific projects. Simultaneously, the lack of adequate tools and materials limits their ability to realize their ideas. This highlights the importance of sustained mentoring and improved access to resources to fully support student development.

2. Input Aspect

The input aspect received a high rating (Excellent – 84.88%), yet several resource limitations were identified. Only 70% of students rated the club's laboratory facilities and equipment as adequate, while the remaining students reported shortages in tools and materials necessary for experimentation. This indicates a need for increased financial investment in laboratory infrastructure to support more advanced scientific activities. Budgetary concerns were also noted. Only 60% of students considered the available funding sufficient, which directly affects the scope and quality of club activities, such as organizing science exhibitions, acquiring materials, or participating in external competitions. Regular financial evaluations by school management are recommended to ensure budget allocations align with the club's operational needs. In terms of human resources, students generally agreed that the science club coaches were knowledgeable and provided valuable guidance. However, some students felt underserved on an individual level, suggesting a need for differentiated instructional approaches. To address this, providing coach training in educational psychology and personalized mentoring strategies could enhance student engagement, especially among those lacking confidence or progressing more slowly. Regarding time management, most students reported that club activities did not interfere with their academic responsibilities. Nonetheless, some expressed concerns about rigid scheduling. Greater flexibility and student involvement in activity planning could help ensure the club remains both beneficial and enjoyable.

From the coaches' perspective, resource limitations remain the primary issue. The existing budget prioritizes theoretical instruction and basic laboratory needs, while more strategic initiatives—such as scientific writing, advanced research, and entrepreneurship training—are not yet well-supported. Additionally, there is a shortage of expert mentors in key areas such as research methodology and science communication. Although the school has initiated partnerships with other institutions and employed digital learning tools, these efforts remain short-term and

insufficient. A more sustainable strategy involving dedicated budget allocation and long-term partnerships with universities, research institutions, and industry stakeholders is essential.

3. Process Aspect

The process dimension received an Excellent category (86.33%). Students found the club's teaching methods engaging and varied, with a strong emphasis on hands-on activities and project-based learning. These approaches foster teamwork, critical thinking, and the production of tangible outcomes. However, some students expressed a desire for greater variety in activities, such as field trips, interdisciplinary collaborations, or experiential studies. Student participation levels were generally high, although a subset of members remained passive. These students faced challenges such as irregular attendance, low engagement in discussions, and incomplete assignments. To improve inclusivity and motivation, strategies such as peer mentoring, interest-based projects, and internal recognition systems should be considered. Feedback from coaches was largely appreciated for being constructive and helpful in improving students' work. However, some students noted that the feedback lacked specificity and did not always promote deeper revisions. Enhancing the structure and clarity of feedback using well-defined assessment criteria could improve the learning process further.

From the perspective of the supervising teachers, the implementation of club activities remains largely administrative. Current evaluations focus mainly on attendance, content delivery, and competition outcomes. There is no robust system in place to assess more nuanced indicators such as creativity, practical skill development, or innovation. Additionally, constraints such as students' tight academic schedules and limited tools often lead to incomplete experiments, which can reduce motivation. Addressing these issues will require a psycho-pedagogical approach—offering training in soft skills (e.g., public speaking, time management), allowing flexible scheduling, and building supportive learning communities to help students navigate challenges collaboratively.

4. Product Aspect

The results of the product aspect evaluation showed Excellent category (87.54%) that the science club had a positive impact on improving students' understanding of science concepts. The most of student felt they understood the concepts better, were able to apply them, and were more confident in explaining them to others. This indicates that the club succeeded in creating an atmosphere of deep and meaningful learning. However, in the aspect of motivation to participate in science competitions, the results were not as strong as the increase in understanding. Only about 70% of students felt motivated to join the competition, and only 65% felt confident. This shows a gap between the increase in knowledge and the courage to compete, which could be caused by the lack of specialized Olympic training, the lack of competition simulations, or the fear of failure. Regarding their work, most students considered their work useful and some had been published. However, there are still many who feel that their work has not had enough impact or has no development opportunities. Therefore, there is a need for further facilitation from schools or external partners to encourage the development and publication of students' scientific work to a higher level (e.g. youth scientific journals, national expos, or technological innovation competitions).

Based on the presentation of the science club coach, the fostered students have recorded a number of proud academic achievements, such as the success of winning medals at the OSN national level and winning championships in financial institution competitions (Ministry of Finance, Financial Services Authority). This shows that the competitive aspect and mastery of the material are quite strong. However, both interviewees agreed that there are still significant shortcomings in the areas of scientific papers and applied science, which should be a measure of the applicative impact of this program. In terms of career impact, students showed interest in specific science fields such as economics and physics. But in general, interest in science careers in the industrial or research sectors is low. This is due to the lack of exposure to the world of work and real science applications. This can be improved by presenting industry figures, conducting field studies to research centre or factories, and involving students in science-based social activities.

The Science Club program at MAN Insan Cendekia Kota Batam has overall succeeded in achieving the main objectives, namely building interest, deepening understanding, and fostering science exploration capabilities among students. This is indicated by high average scores (4 or more on average) in almost all evaluation indicators. In line with that, the interview results of two interviewees agreed that the Science Club program of MAN Insan Cendekia Kota Batam already has a strong foundation as a forum for developing students' achievements in science, especially in terms of competitions such as OSN. However, to become a truly holistic program with long-term impact, the program still needs a number of important improvements in the form of facilities and budget that are still not optimal, student motivation and confidence in competing, less active student involvement, as well as improving the quality of mentoring and feedback.

Based on the evaluation results, the following are several categories recommendations:

a) Context
Increase the socialization of the club's vision and mission through orientation activities and internal media. Systematically integrate club activities with the formal science curriculum.
b) Input
Conduct regular procurement of practicum tools and materials. Expand funding for activities and increase training of coaches on an ongoing basis.
c) Process
Vary learning methods with scientific visits, field studies and competition simulations. Establish a student mentoring system to increase participation and ownership.
d) Product
Hold intensive training for science Olympiad and innovation competitions. Build cooperation with external agencies for publication and development of student work.

CONCLUSION

Based on the evaluation conducted using the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) model, it can be concluded that the Science Club program at MAN Insan Cendekia Batam City has been implemented with a reasonable degree of effectiveness, particularly in fostering students' academic competencies and interest in science. The club has successfully served as a platform to nurture student potential through active participation in the National Science Olympiad (OSN), scientific experimentation, and project-based learning activities.
However, the program's effectiveness is not yet optimal across all dimensions. Several critical challenges remain and must be addressed to enhance its overall impact:

1) Limited Resources, constraint in budget allocation, laboratory facilities, and the availability of expert mentors – especially in scientific writing and applied science – pose significant barriers to the program's growth.
2) Evaluation Limitations, the current assessment system is predominantly administrative and fails to comprehensively capture the quality of student learning outcomes and long-term developmental impact.
3) Achievement Disparities, while academic performance in competitions is notable, student contributions in the form of scientific publications, innovations, and practical science applications remain limited.
4) Lack of Industry Exposure, students generally have limited insight into professional opportunities within the science and technology sectors, highlighting a gap in career-oriented guidance and industrial exposure

Suggestion

To strengthen the quality and long-term impact of the Science Club program, the following strategic measures are recommended:

1) Resource Enhancement. Establish a dedicated and sustainable budget allocation for the science club, encompassing procurement of experimental equipment, laboratory supplies, and support for scientific publication initiatives. Foster strategic partnerships with universities, research centres, and industry stakeholders to enhance access to resources and mentorship from external experts.
2) Strengthening Evaluation System. Design a comprehensive evaluation framework that assesses students' critical thinking, creativity, innovation, collaboration, and scientific communication skills. Implement periodic monitoring and student surveys to assess the development of competencies and interests as indicators of program effectiveness.
3) Diversification of Activities. Broaden the scope of club activities by incorporating interdisciplinary science projects, applied research initiatives, and the development of science-based products. Organize exhibitions showcasing student scientific work, host internal science competitions, and facilitate writing and publication opportunities in youth science journals or school publications.
4) Optimization of Implementation Process. Develop a more flexible and adaptive activity schedule that accommodates students' academic responsibilities. Provide structured soft skills training—including scientific writing, public speaking, and time management—to better prepare students for participation in scientific forums and competitions. Expansion of Networks and Exposure. Facilitate student participation in seminars, workshops, and site visits to scientific institutions and industries to enhance their understanding of real-world science careers. Collaborate with other high-performing schools and scientific communities to enrich learning experiences and foster peer-driven motivation.

REFERENCES

Alifah, S, dan M I Umarella, "Evaluasi CIPP pada Program Ekstrakurikuler di SMA Al Barokah Tangerang Selatan Banten," JUPENSAL: Jurnal Pendidikan Universal, 1.1 (2024), hal. 7–12 <https://journalwbl.com/index.php/jupensal/article/view/27%0Ahttps://journalwbl.com/index.php/jupensal/article/download/27/16>

Antariksa, Walid Fajar, Abdul Fattah, dan Mutiara Arlisyah Putri Utami, "Evaluasi Program Pendidikan Pesantren Mahasiswa Model Cipp (Context, Input, Process, Product)," Evaluasi: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam, 6.1 (2022), hal. 75–86, doi:10.32478/evaluasi.v6i1.848

Azman, W., & Saputra, D., "Evaluasi Program Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam. EDUKASI, 13(1), 162-170.," 11.1 (2025), hal. 1–8

Budi Yoga Bhakti, "Evaluasi Program Model CIPP Pada Proses," Jurnal Inovasi Pendidikan Fisika dan Riset Ilmiah, 1.2 (2017), hal. 75–82

HUDALLOH, M., "EVALUASI PROGRAM KEGIATAN EKTRAKURIKULER SAINS DAN MATEMATIKA DI SD NU SLEMAN YOGYAKARTA (Doctoral dissertation, UIN Sunan Kalijaga).," Sustainability (Switzerland), 11.1 (2019), hal. 1–14 <http://scioteca.caf.com/bitstream/handle/123456789/1091/RED2017-Eng-8ene.pdf?sequence=12&isAllowed=y%0Ahttp://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.regsciurbeco.2008.06.005%0Ahttps://www.researchgate.net/publication/305320484_SISTEM_PEMBETUNGAN_TERPUSAT_STRATEGI_MELESTARI>

Madaus, G. F., M. S. Scriven, D. L. Stufflebeam, dan D. L. Stufflebeam, "The CIPP Model for Program Evaluation. Evaluation models: Viewpoints on Educational and Human Services Evaluation, 117-141.," 1983

Madaus, G. F., M. Scriven, dan D. L. (Eds.). Stufflebeam, "Evaluation Models: Viewpoints on Educational and Human Services Evaluation (Vol. 6). Springer Science & Business Media.," 2012

Newcomer, K. E., H. P. Hatry, dan J. S. (Eds.). Wholey, "Handbook of Practical Program Evaluation (Vol. 864). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.," 2015, hal. 1–10, doi:10.33541/sp.v1i1.459.2

Nukhbatillah, I. A., S. Setiawati, U. Hasanah, dan N. Nurmalasari, "Evaluasi Mutu Pendidikan Menggunakan Pendekatan Teori Stufflebeam. Jurnal Global Futuristik, 2(1), 34-43.," 2024

Rahmat, Zetri, Universita Islam, Negeri Sultan, Syarif Kasim, dan Universitas Negeri Padang, "Model Evaluasi CIPP dalam Program Sekolah: Systematic Literature Review. Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan (JKIP), 5(4), 911-919.," 5.4 (2025), hal. 911–19

Stufflebeam, D. L., & Shinkfield, A. J., "Systematic Evaluation: A Self-Instructional Guide to Theory and Practice (Vol. 8). Springer Science & Business Media.," 2012

Sugiyono, D., "Metode Penelitian Pendidikan Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D.," 2013

Syahrir, S., "Evaluasi Kurikulum Belajar Mandiri TK Menggunakan Model CIPP Stufflebeam. Jurnal Ilmiah Mandala Education, 8(1), 509-520.," 2022

ULIYAH, N., "Evaluasi Program Ekstrakurikuler SKI (Sie Keagamaan Islam) Dengan Menggunakan Model Context, Input, Process, Product (CIPP) Di MAN 1 Kota Kediri (Doctoral dissertation, IAIN Kediri).," 2019, hal. 23–37

Yarbrough, D. B., L. M. Shulha, R. K. Hopson, dan F. A. Caruthers, "The Program Evaluation Standards: A Guide for Evaluators and Evaluation Users. Sage Publications.," 2010, hal. 1–10, doi:10.33541/sp.v1i1.459.2

Yaswinda, Y., & Erlina, B., "Model Evaluasi CIPP Dalam Mengevaluasi Program Peran Orang Tua Berpartisipasi dalam Kegiatan Ekstrakurikuler untuk Pengembangan Diri Anak Di TK An-Nadzir Kecamatan Payakumbuh Timur Kota Payakumbuh. Jurnal Inovasi Penelitian, 2(8), 2523-2534.," 2.8 (2022), hal. 2523–34